



## **Review of the study program Law and Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure (BA) from alumni perspective**

College ESLG conducted a program evaluation and distributed the program evaluation form to all bachelor students' graduates through Google Forms. From 127 graduates to whom the questionnaire was distributed only 26 responded. The same evaluation form is also available in the Electronic Grading System but it is not mandatory. The College ESLG will make the program evaluation form mandatory to all graduates before and they must fill it immediately upon the login in Electronic Grading System

The survey is composed of five sections. Sections of the survey are as follows:

1. PREPARATION AND SUCCESS IN LABOR MARKET – composed of nine questions with Likert Scale from 1 to 5 (very dissatisfied to very satisfied);
2. ACQUIRED KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS - composed of eleven questions with Likert Scale from 1 to 5 (very dissatisfied to very satisfied);
3. Written comments with three text boxes composed of which part of the program prepared you best for the career advancement, which part of the program prepared you the least for the labor market and what would you improve in the quality of the program to best cope with the career and labor market challenges in Kosovo and internationally;

The present study of alumni evaluation of the program shall focus on each section separately and draw recommendations for each of them, which will be further incorporated in the end in the strategic plan document of the study program. We run both descriptive statistics and multiple regression to generalize about the effect of each of independent variables on the dependent variable.



## PREPARATION FOR AND SUCCESS IN THE LABOR MARKET

For each section the descriptive statistics was run in order to superficially find out which of the aspects of preparation and success in the labor market influenced mostly the alumni satisfaction (those students that were subject to program evaluation). The descriptive statistics analysis was run in SPSS. The variables included in the bachelor program alumni survey are not the same as the ones performed for master studies. The bachelor version has less variables related to preparation and success in the labor market. The statistical analysis has been presented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Descriptive statistics for preparation and success in the labor market**

Descriptive Statistics							
	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation	Variance	
Transition to labor market	26	3	5	4.19	.849	.722	
Preparation for labor market	26	3	5	4.35	.689	.475	
Employment progress	26	2	5	4.00	.894	.800	
Progress in entrepreneurship	26	2	5	4.23	.908	.825	
Career advancement	26	3	5	4.35	.745	.555	
level of preparation and success in the labor market	26	2	5	4.19	.749	.562	
Valid N (listwise)	26						

Source: SPSS

From 129 respondents (existing graduates of the bachelor program) who were sent an invitation to fill program evaluation forms only 27 responded effectively. Questions of the questionnaire were with Likert Scale 1(very dissatisfied), 2 (dissatisfied), 3(somewhat satisfied), 4 (satisfied) and 5 (very satisfied). From the responses, the present report finds out that all respondents are highly satisfied with the level that the program prepares them for labor market and the success they achieve in the labor market by each of the variables having the mean higher than 4.0 as described in Table 1. From all variables preparation for labor market has the highest mean of 4.35 and standard deviation of 0.689 and 0.475 followed by career advancement with the same mean of 4.35 but wider standard deviation of 0.745 and variance of 0.555. Next progress in entrepreneurship as a consequence of study program has achieved the mean of 4.23 followed by transition in the labor market with the mean of 4.19 and level of preparation and success in the labor market. The



# College ESG

lowest mean is achieved by employment progress with only 4.0 and standard deviation of 0.894 and variance of 0.800.

Next we run multiple regression to see which of the independent variables has the highest effect on the level of preparation and success in the labor market.

**Table 2: Multiple regression for preparation and success in labor market**  
**Coefficients<sup>a</sup>**

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Coefficients		
1	(Constant)	1.590	.715		2.225	.038
	Transition to labor market	.212	.220	.240	.964	.346
	Preparation for labor market	-.029	.309	-.027	-.095	.925
	Employment progress	.659	.188	.786	3.499	.002
	Progress in entrepreneurship	-.058	.154	-.070	-.375	.711
	Career advancement	-.127	.207	-.126	-.611	.548

a. Dependent Variable: level of preparation and success in the labor market

From independent variables only employment progress has the highest positive effect on the level of preparation and success in the labor market with  $b=0.659$  and  $t=3.499$  meeting the Nunnally (1969) requirement, which is  $b>0.1$  and  $t>1.96$ .

## ACQUIRED KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS

The descriptive statistics for the alumni satisfaction with the acquired knowledge and skills has been presented in Table 3.



# College ESLG

**Table 3: Descriptive statistics for acquired knowledge and skills**

## Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
program helped you to write clearly and effectively	26	3	5	4.38	.697
Program helped you to work effectively as a team member	26	3	5	4.62	.571
Program helped you to acquire skills on your own	26	3	5	4.38	.637
Program helped you to communicate well orally	26	3	5	4.23	.710
Program helped you to be an effective leader	26	2	5	4.23	.765
Program helped you to be an innovator	26	3	5	4.12	.816
Program helped you to think analytically	26	3	5	4.27	.667
Program helped you to have awareness for environment	26	3	5	4.46	.706
Program helped you to function independently	26	3	5	4.31	.736
Program helped you to identify moral and ethical issues	26	3	5	4.12	.711
General satisfaction with the level of knowledge and skills that you acquired during the bachelor program	26	3	5	4.42	.578
Valid N (listwise)	26				

College European School of Law and Governance  
 Nazim Gafurri 33 10000 Prishtina Kosovo

**Tel:** 038 602 405

**M:** 045 456 666

**E-mail:** [info@eukos.org](mailto:info@eukos.org)



# College ESG

From the descriptive statistics, students have high satisfaction with all the skills that they think they gained due to the study program, whereby all of them achieved the mean higher than 4.0. Program helped you to work effectively as a team member is the skill that reached the highest mean of satisfaction of students with 4.62 and standard deviation of 0.571, whereas Program helped you to be an innovator has the lowest mean of 4.12 and standard deviation of 0.816.

Next, we run a multiple regression analysis to see which independent variables have the highest effect on the dependent variable, which is General satisfaction with the level of knowledge and skills that you acquired during the bachelor program. Multiple regression analysis has been presented in Table 4.

**Table 4: Multiple regression for level of satisfaction of skills and knowledge acquired during the bachelor study program**

### Coefficients<sup>a</sup>

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	-.188	.758		-.248	.808
	program helped you to write clearly and effectively	-.187	.249	-.226	-.752	.464
	Program helped you to work effectively as a team member	.366	.207	.362	1.767	.097
	Program helped you to acquire skills on your own	.374	.261	.413	1.432	.173
	Program helped you to communicate well orally	.252	.184	.310	1.369	.191
	Program helped you to be an effective leader	-.158	.208	-.210	-.761	.458
	Program helped you to be an innovator	.233	.169	.329	1.373	.190
	Program helped you to think analytically	.138	.220	.159	.626	.541



# College ESLG

Program helped you to have awareness for environment	.233	.171	.285	1.365	.192
Program helped you to function independently	-.137	.189	-.174	-.723	.481
Program helped you to identify moral and ethical issues	-.070	.252	-.087	-.278	.784

a. Dependent Variable: General satisfaction with the level of knowledge and skills that you acquired during the bachelor program

From the multiple regression analysis Program helped you to work effectively as a team member has  $b = .366$  and  $t = 1.767$  having the highest effect on the level of knowledge and skills acquired during the bachelor program, followed by Program helped you to acquire skills on your own with  $b = 0.374$  and  $t = 1.432$ . The same moderate effect is exercised also by the variables Program helped you to be an innovator with  $b = 0.233$  and  $t = 1.373$  and Program helped you to communicate well orally with  $b = 0.252$  and  $t = 1.369$  and Program helped you to have awareness for environment with  $b = 0.233$  and  $t = 1.365$ .

The variables with the very low effect are program helped you to identify moral and ethical issues, program helped you to function independently, program helped you to think analytically, program helped you to be an effective leader, and program helped you to write effectively and clearly.

## QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS BASED ON WRITTEN COMMENTS

The table of respondents with the written comments on best part of the program, the part of the program which least contributed to their success in the labor market and how would they improve the overall quality of the program to increase the success in the labor market has been presented in Table 5.



# College ESLG

**Table 5: Responses of students**

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>Which part of the program prepared you the best for the labor market and career advancement</b>	<b>Which part of the program prepared you the least for the labor market and career advancement</b>	<b>What would you improve in the overall quality of the bachelor program in preparing you best for labor market and career advancement locally and internationally?</b>
R1	Project management, real estate appraisal	Sustainable architecture	Elective courses
R2	Lectures with concrete examples	No remarks	More frequent practical (site) visits
R3	For my advancement in career the program helped me most in civil law (commercial, obligations law etc).	I can not say that there was part of the program that prepared me less. Naturally there were courses that were less important for my field of work but I can not specify any of them	Minimal need to improve the program that is veing offered, perhaps would be important to add importance on the courses relevant to acaemic writing and add a course for statistics and some courses dealing with macroeconomics of real estate. Nevertheless, the program is very compact and enables an easy access to the labor market
R4	Debates and project work		Lectures to be more interactive. Opinions of students although they can be wrong must be welcomed by professors



# College ESLG

R5	Research methods (independent research work).	Evaluation based on exams (Revising materials just to pass an exam is not the best method to evaluate/grade a student. Studying must be based on continuous learning and that can be reached by giving students chance to make independent writings or collaborating with others in order to analyse and solve daily basis problems. Hence we give students power to create independent research work and create progress in their professional/academic sphere.)	More research papers, more collaboration with other students/universities towards finding solutions for modern problems, exchange experiences with regional and EU universities, establish NGOs, etc.
R6	Assessment part	No remarks	No remarks
R7	Team work assignments, independent research work	Classic examinations and memorization of definitions in some of the courses, which I did not need at all for the labor market at all	Include more research work as part of assignments.





# College ESLG

R8	Projects and Assignments	N/A	Including mock trials in the modules and assignments such as drafting legal contracts and legal opinions.
R9			
R10	Real estate valuation	No remarks	No remarks
R11	All the courses have their own specifics, I can not single out any of them. When I started my work in real estate appraisal, I had to use all my knowledge to write an appraisal report. In this report many of the courses that I studied in the program are intertwined	The bachelor program did not have any part which prepared you less for the labor market	The program prepares you good for the labor market especially for those that are attentive during the educational process
R12	I can say that each part contributed equally to preparation for labor market	-	-
R13			
R14	Real estate valuation	Introduction to administrative law	Having more practical work classes
R15			
R16	Group work	Lectures from incompetent instructors	Practice should be more organized.

College European School of Law and Governance  
 Nazim Gafurri 33 10000 Prishtina Kosovo

**Tel:** 038 602 405

**M:** 045 456 666

**E-mail:** [info@eukos.org](mailto:info@eukos.org)



# College ESLG

R17	In general all the program of my bachelor degree helped me in different perspective for the labor market and also the career advancement. The best part of the program that helped me in my career advancement was all the subjects regarding the Real Estate market, Marketing, Energy Efficiency etc taking into account that today I currently work in the different projects regarding the areas mentioned above.	The program that I've studied is connected in such a strategic manner that has no parts that can not help in labor market and in career advancement.	
R18			
R19	Independent work (research)	Exam based evaluation	Exchange programs, establishing NGOs for diff. purpose, etc
R20	Part of lectures and exercises held in class by taking concrete examples using various case studies	All the parts had a positive impact especially lectures, interactive teaching and practical exercises	Practical site visits and exercises
R21	Problem-based learning, case study approach	practice since I was already employed	site visits, more collaborative projects with the industry
R22			



# College ESLG

R23	Practical examples	Parts of the program that are less related to the program, but we had to take those courses	More practical examples and site visits and have the English language be mandatory or any other language
R24	Case studies, different team and individual project work	Some of the courses did not have practical work but were pure lectures. And lack of exercises with assistants for our generation which were added next years	To include more case studies to push students to think more strategically. To add more interaction during lectures. To implement exercises in most of the courses
R25	Legal courses, management courses and real estate appraisal courses of Professor Visar, real estate registration	Sustainable building materials	I would add some courses related to GIS
R26	Seminar works and case studies elaborated with students during lectures	Lack of Albanian language literature	More site practical visits

From the qualitative analysis some of the issues are recurring in most of the responses of the students such as real estate appraisal, problem-based learning, lectures with case studies, research and essay assignments as best parts of the program.

The respondents think that adding more exercises, more research in each of the courses and more field visits are the components that should be strengthened further so students can have more success in the labor market.



# College ESG

## **EVALUATION BY PROGRAM DIRECTOR AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The program director Assoc. Prof. Dr. Visar Hoxha after thorough examination of the findings from the alumnae program evaluation, reaches the following conclusions:

### **PREPARATION FOR AND SUCCESS IN THE LABOR MARKET**

Students have the satisfaction with the mean of greater than 4.0 with regards to preparation for and success in the labor market in all the fields, however they have the lowest satisfaction on employment progress with the mean of 4.0. Also from multiple regression analysis the employment progress has the highest effect on the overall satisfaction of students with the level of preparation and success in the labor market.

#### **Recommendation:**

- Increase the memoranda of understanding with construction sector for paid practical internship of students so students can have better employment opportunities;
- Organize recruitment fair for the construction sector companies, where they can recruit for real estate managers;
- Better career counselling support and advise for students who are about to graduate.

### **ACQUIRED KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS**

Students have the satisfaction with the mean of greater than 4.0 with regards to acquired knowledge and skills in all the fields, however they have the lowest satisfaction with the Program helped you to be an innovator, which has the lowest mean of 4.12 and standard deviation of 0.816. On the other hand, from multiple regression we conclude that the variables with the very low effect on the level of satisfaction of alumni on the preparation and success in the labor market (which has a generally high mean greater than 4.0) are program helped you to identify moral and ethical issues, program helped you to function independently, program helped you to think analytically, program helped you to be an effective leader, and program helped you to write effectively and clearly.

#### **Recommendation:**

- Add more innovative project assignments in the classes;

College European School of Law and Governance  
Nazim Gafurri 33 10000 Prishtina Kosovo

**Tel:** 038 602 405

**M:** 045 456 666

**E-mail:** [info@eukos.org](mailto:info@eukos.org)



# College ESLG

- Include the Best Innovator Award in the field of construction and real estate management, with the scholarship awarded for the winner;
- Add ethical dilemma problems as case study problems nearly in each course to strengthen the identification of moral and ethical issues;

## QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS BASED ON WRITTEN COMMENTS

From the qualitative analysis the recurring issues arise in most of the responses of respondents as best feature of the program that helped them most in the career and success in labor market:

- Real estate appraisal;
- Problem-based learning with case studies;

From the qualitative analysis the recurring issues arise as the most relevant among alumni responses as what needs improvement in the program to help them better in coping with challenges of labor market locally and internationally are:

- More exercises;
- Increase site visits;
- Better coordination of practical obligation;

## RECOMMENDATION

- Increase the number of exercises with mentors and tutors
- Implement these memoranda of cooperation with more site visits and practical work of alumni with private sector companies;

Assoc. prof. Dr. Visar Hoxha, Head of Department, **10.02.2020**



College European School of Law and Governance  
Nazim Gafurri 33 10000 Prishtina Kosovo

**Tel:** 038 602 405

**M:** 045 456 666

**E-mail:** [info@eukos.org](mailto:info@eukos.org)